

# **Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel**

# **Quarterly Hearing**

# Witness: The Minister for International

# Development

Friday, 22nd March 2019

## Panel:

Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence (Chairman) Deputy D. Johnson of St. Mary (Vice-Chairman) Deputy S.M. Wickenden of St. Helier

## Witnesses:

Deputy C.F. Labey of Grouville, The Minister for International Development Mr. S. Boas, Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission

[11:07]

## Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence (Chairman):

Thank you, Minister, for coming along ...

**The Minister for International Development:** My pleasure.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

... to this first hearing of the Minister for International Development, so it is an auspicious occasion. We are very pleased with that. We have scheduled an hour and we will absolutely try - we have had 5 minutes so we are going to be a bit late - but we will absolutely try to keep it to that. I have a funny feeling we have got more questions than we will be able to get through in an hour but in future we will perhaps go to an hour and a half, or an hour with a separate half-hour buffer, if you know what I mean, in case.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Okay.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Before we start we will just go around the table to state our names for the record, if that is okay.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden of St. Helier:

Deputy Scott Wickenden, I am a panel member on the Economic Affairs and I am Deputy of St. Helier District No. 1.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Kirsten Morel, chairman of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel and Deputy of St. Lawrence.

## Deputy D. Johnson of St. Mary (Vice-Chairman):

David Johnson, vice-chairman of this panel and Deputy of St. Mary.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Carolyn Labey, the Minister for International Development and Deputy of Grouville.

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Simon Boas, Executive Director of Jersey Overseas Aid.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Excellent and thank you, Simon, for coming along as well. Yes, we do not have much time so we will get straight into it. We are here because it is the first meeting with the Minister for International Development and so we are really here to try principally to understand your role, the department, how it works with the commission, just exploring that. We do have some kind of issues, basically questions as well, but that is I think because we want to understand as Scrutiny members, that is the main part of what we are looking for today. So, as your role of the Minister for International Development is a new ministerial position, would you mind starting by outlining the role and its key responsibilities?

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes, well the Chief Minister was very keen to set up a Ministry for International Development and Children, so I was appointed as a Minister at the same time. Historically, Jersey Overseas Aid had

been a committee and then when we went into ministerial government in 2005 it became a commission because the thinking behind that was to keep it guite independent. We are made up of 3 non-States Members and 3 Members, so we like to think that it is a body that receives the biggest States grant out of all the arm's-length organisations. We would like to think that we are free from political influence when we are making our decisions, our grant-giving decisions. So, we were a commission but I know the Chief Minister wanted this time around to raise the profile of international development. I always say that Jersey Overseas Aid is almost like Jersey's best-kept secret and it is in line with E.U. (European Union) and O.E.C.D. (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development) countries to have international development at the top table. It gives it far more credibility and it signals to the world that Jersey takes its international responsibilities seriously. So, as well as that, I think I can say that receiving one of the largest ... well the largest grant from the States, we should rightly be more accountable, so here we are today sitting in front of Scrutiny, whereas we would not have been with the commission probably. I will be taking questions without notice next week, so we feel it gives us more accountability. That is one aspect of the role of International Development, to take it in its broadest sense. The thinking was to develop our international profile: how does the rest of the world see us? With that, we have got to establish or enhance our own Island identity so that people, sports people, artists, business people when they travel around the world, we can say who we are: this is Jersey. So there is a job of work to be done in that respect and that I see as our international development.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Fascinating, thank you very much. You mentioned accountability under the new structure.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Why did you feel it was important for the Government of Jersey to include international development as a full ministerial role rather than an assistant ministerial role? Or why did the Chief Minister feel that? Because accountability could have been given at the assistant ministerial level as well in that sense because the ministry could report there, so what was their reason for it being a full ministerial role?

#### The Minister for International Development:

It would very much depend which ministry you are going to put it under, and if you are later going to be asking me about External Relations, to be Assistant Minister for External Relations. While we work incredibly well with External Relations, and there are a lot of synergies with countries that we have and work that Simon is doing with FRACCK (Framework for the Return of Assets from Corruption and Crime in Kenya) and the rest, it is very, very important to keep aid and trade separate and to demonstrate that you are because the minute you start to amalgamate them or muddy the waters, you compromise both aid and trade. We give aid on a needs basis and that should not be compromised with whatever is happening politically or with whichever markets External Relations ...

#### Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

Economy based, which is obviously trade, whereas aid is neither of those things, so, yes.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes. So, I think it gives both far more credibility if they are separate and also it has been incredibly useful to sit around the table where we would do the Common Strategic Plan - we were writing the Common Strategic Plan around the Council of Ministers - to have some input into that from an aid perspective, from an international development perspective, Island identity, all those kind of things, and also to sit around the Council of Ministers' table when it comes to budgets and Government Plan. I think it is right that International Development is there, not sort of as an Assistant Minister role. I do not know if you have anything to add to that.

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

No, I think that is absolutely right.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

You have mentioned budgets, you mentioned the largest grant that the Government gives; briefly, what resources, including keeping a budget, do you have at your disposal as the Minister for International Development?

#### The Minister for International Development:

£10.38 million. Those are 2018 figures but they are very, very similar. We have not yet done the accounts for this year but 2018, I will just get ... £10.34 million?

#### [11:15]

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Yes, is the grant. There was a carry over which is why we spent £10.38, just to clarify that.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

That is your budget as Minister of that role and the commission's budget? I am just trying to get a differential between the 2.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Right, that is Jersey Overseas Aid.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

The Jersey Overseas ...

**The Minister for International Development:** Yes.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Right, that is a good point.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

As your ministerial role, do you have any budget or resources available to you at all?

**The Minister for International Development:** No.

Deputy S.M. Wickenden: No?

The Deputy of St. Mary: That is what I was getting at, yes.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, one of the things we are interested in finding out is whether there is a department in the departmental aspect or if it is all through Jersey Overseas Aid. How many people do you have within the ...?

#### The Minister for International Development:

Within Jersey Overseas Aid?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, who do you work with?

## The Minister for International Development:

Jersey Overseas Aid we have 4 staff and we have ... well, we are about to have 4 staff. We have got 3 at the moment, we have got a new person starting in May, and we have an intern every year now so that is ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Is that a paid intern or not?

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

You are remunerated from the commission rather than ... because you as Minister have no budget, then it all comes out of the commission?

The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Yes, okay.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

So all those people ...

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

All your expenses for paying staff come out of the commission?

## The Minister for International Development:

For Jersey Overseas Aid, yes.

## **The Deputy of St. Mary:** Yes.

**Deputy K.F. Morel:** Of that £10.38 million?

## **The Minister for International Development:** Yes.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Lastly from me for a little while, do you feel these resources are sufficient?

## The Minister for International Development:

The £10.38 million equates to 0.25 per cent. The budget is going down. It will go down to 0.21 per cent in 2019 because our G.D.P. (Gross Domestic Product) fluctuated and we have not quite recovered.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

I was going to ask: is that because of an increase in G.V.A. (Gross Value Added) or is that because the budget is decreasing? Or both?

## The Minister for International Development:

Well the budget is not increasing, so it is decreasing [as a percentage of rising GVA].

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

So it is decreasing, as well as the G.V.A. perhaps has increased and therefore it is a smaller proportion of that?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes. So at the moment, well for 2019, we will be 0.21 per cent of G.D.P. As you probably know, the sustainable development goal is 0.27 per cent.

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

It is 0.7 per cent.

## The Minister for International Development:

Sorry, 0.7 per cent. Yes, sorry, 0.7 per cent.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, so basically only a third of the way there?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes. Britain, Great Britain reaches 0.7 per cent, some Scandinavian countries are more than. We are on a par with Spain and Portugal, Ireland ...

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, that makes sense. Jersey's G.D.P. is about £4 billion, so, yes, you would be looking at about £30 million which would be about ...

## The Minister for International Development:

Luxembourg is 1.1 per cent.

Deputy K.F. Morel: Yes.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

So when the amount is determined, is it done by reference to this percentage? When the amount of funds you are given, as it were, is it calculated by reference to the 0.21 per cent formula or is that what it works out at having been given a lump sum?

## The Minister for International Development:

That is what it works out at the moment.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Okay, so you do not apply a fraction like they do in the U.K. (United Kingdom)?

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

No.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Okay.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

So I am missing (c), just so David knows, because I think it has been answered. As you are Minister and you are in charge of policy, which are the main policy areas that you intend to develop during your time as Minister?

## The Minister for International Development:

Well, all of them, really. We have made huge amounts of reform. Since I took over as chair at the end of 2014, we moved into an office and then we started to employ professional staff. So Simon has been with us since the end of 2016 and we started to make huge, huge reforms within Overseas Aid. What particular ones? Well none really ... well none and all. All of them. We categorise our budget in various sections. We have got emergencies, which is £2.8 million and we have revised how we give and the amounts we give, so £100,000 per agency and £300,000 per crisis. Grant aid, we have increased the amount of grants that we have given and we have moved into multi-year because we feel that we can have the greatest amount of impact with larger multi-year projects and they are more sustainable.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

On the multi-year front, do you have a kind of set - perhaps it is too fixed - but multi-year, does that mean 5 years or does it always depend on the project or do you kind of look for 5-year projects?

#### The Minister for International Development:

Three to 4.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Three to 4 years?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Would it help to give a very quick carry on to the basis on your platform of some of those reforms and changes which you are planning to continue?

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

I guess where I am kind of looking at here is when you took over the chairmanship, you really did a lot of work I know because of speaking to you in the past about setting up real guidelines and policies about who, how, where and when you give money in aid to, so it is to the right people for the right reasons. That was the beginning point, so is that a moving policy or ...

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes. Well we are for ever looking at our policies. We have reduced the countries that we give aid to and we have now got a mathematical formula of giving which is we divide the Corruption Perceptions Index by the Human Development Index squared.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I just ask, Simon, did you come up with that?

## The Minister for International Development:

Well, it was not going to be me, was it?

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

It would not have been me neither.

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Yes.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Would you mind perhaps explaining it but also after this session if you would not mind sending that and the rationale behind it in written form to Kellie.

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Sure. I think it makes us, as far as I know, the only governmental donor in the world officially to take corruption into account as well as need when choosing countries. So, as the Minister said, one of the really key things, one of the big changes, has been to narrow down the countries we do development projects in. Because in one sense our budget is a lot of money and in the great scheme of things from an international development point of view, you really have to focus it to make sure that it does good, so we have narrowed down the countries from 45 or so in 2016. Now if you think the U.K. has £14 billion a year and works in 28 countries, it gives you some idea of how thinly we were spreading ourselves. So, we narrowed them down to 12 and from this year we will narrow them down to 7.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Which is why I said it is a constant review.

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Yes, exactly, so that is a good example of reform in progress. So we came up with this algorithm where we take into account the Human Development Index which is a U.N. (United Nations) measure, a proxy of development needs based on life expectancy, education, things like that. We have also ...

#### The Minister for International Development:

We just take the bottom 50.

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Exactly. You concentrate on the neediest countries which score lowest on that but at the same time we want to work in countries that are not corrupt. Now of course there is an overlap between needs and corruption, so we have taken Transparency International's Corruption Perceptions Index and found a way of combining them so that all other things being equal, we try and work in the neediest but least corrupt places. Now, it is not perfect. We also took a few other considerations into account. For example, we preferred Anglophone countries, not from any prejudice against Francophone ones, but because to be good at development you need to understand what they want to do. You need to be able to read their 5-year plan for dairy, to make a relationship with the Minister of Agriculture. In fact, part of the rationale of having fewer countries is that eventually our programmes can feed on each other and benefit from themselves. We gain from economies of scale, we become much more experts at understanding what a country's needs are, what works. Even the quality of different aid agencies and development organisations varies, not just between them, but between countries. One can be really good in Malawi and not very good in Mozambique. So developing that specialist knowledge was a really good rationale for narrowing down the countries and also for taking corruption into account. It is not just that we do not want to waste taxpayers' money; we are very conscious of the fact that that is what we are funded by. So we have an obligation to Jersey's

taxpayers as much as we do in one sense to the world's poor. But also it is quite a good proxy for world development interventions work because if you are working in a country where things get stolen, where bribes need to be paid to teachers even to send your children to primary school, where officials are corrupt and will not do things without a bribe, the likelihood is that your work is not going to have a lasting sustainable effect too. To take 2 examples, with this formula we have come up with these 7 countries, Malawi is one of them. In global needs terms and the Human Development Index it is about 170-odd in the ranking of 200-or-so countries. In terms of corruption, it is 120th. Rwanda, which I am sure you know is one of the countries that we have focused on, is about 160 in terms of need, so it is still one of the very poorest countries in the world, but only about 50 in terms of corruption. It is seen as less corrupt than places like South Korea and Italy and so that was the rationale behind that. That is a very good example of one of the perhaps 20 or so reforms.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes. Another big change that we made and, again, we are constantly looking at this, was to reduce the themes, the thematic viewpoint of Jersey Overseas Aid, the themes that we want to get into. Because before we would go into specialist health, wash programmes, everything, and we just felt it would be far better for us if we developed our own expertise in particular areas but also to play on Jersey's strengths. With that, we have chosen dairy, we have chosen conservation, livelihoods and financial inclusion. So, again, when people travel around the world, and if these projects are successful, which many of them are, like dairy; the Jersey cow is our greatest ambassador in Rwanda. People know Jersey, that is our international profile, because of the work that we are doing with the Jersey cow. Likewise, financial inclusion, we have partnered with Comic Relief and we have got financial infrastructure here, expertise on-Island, so that sort of adds to Jersey's strengths.

#### Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

So it is greatest benefit for limited resources?

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Exactly. That is exactly right.

#### Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

Yes. I think we will move on so we can get through some questions ...

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Sorry, before you do that. The corruption index intrigues me, and I understand the logic, is there not a danger that the countries in most need may well be in most need because they are corrupt, because things are not getting through there? I mean, can you influence your ... can you barter with them or say: "We will give you aid if..." and I take it also there is a distinction between emergency

aid, which we will perhaps get on to later, and the long-term development between ... when you veto a country, is there any negotiation? Do they know why you are vetoing them?

## The Minister for International Development:

You can answer that substantially, but I would just say that we have got one eye on the taxpayer as well. We cannot go into countries that are hugely corrupt and be seen to be sort of bartering and might have to give someone whatever in order to get the aid in. Those countries almost deserve to be ... if they can wake up and see other countries who are less corrupt getting aid, it might ...

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

I fully understand, I mean, we are on the same page, but I was just concerned that if they knew that you would ... not about bartering, getting aid in where there is a corrupt system, but if you were able to influence the way that aid got to a certain area, I was just wondering if there are any ... you obviously do not go down that line with your aid?

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

It is a very good question because, as you rightly say, often there is a correlation between corruption and needs. I mean, I suppose we view it that the needs are so much greater than what we can provide and we can still choose to work in ... and we work in some of the neediest countries on earth and we have given more weight to needs than to corruption in this formula. But we also have to be realistic that global aid flows are about 150 billion U.S. (United States) dollars a year. So, I worked it out the other day, I might be wrong, but I think our £10 million is 45 minutes of that.

[11:30]

Which does not give us a huge amount of leverage with the countries themselves but I think setting an example in the sector. What we are doing, other governments are beginning to take notice of Jersey. What the Minister was saying as well about us focusing on our strengths and developing a reputation, and finding areas to work in where we can do more than just sign the cheques, where we can deploy our expertise and where people go: "Oh, Jersey: dairy and development." Or financial services for poor people.

## The Minister for International Development:

We can also work with those themes with local charities like the R.J.A. and H.S. (Royal Jersey Agricultural and Horticultural Society), like Durrell. We work with the Gurkhas for our work in Nepal, so we have got big, strong links with charities here and people on the ground there.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Excellent. Could I just quickly ask before Scott carries on, do you know anywhere else which uses the same mathematical formula or is it a Jersey innovation?

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

I do not know any.

The Minister for International Development:

I think you can claim that as yours.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

That is what I am thinking, I am happy for us to claim this.

**Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:** Yes.

The Deputy of St. Mary: Can you influence the others then, please?

**Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:** Well when I say it to others, they go: "Oh, wow, that is a good idea."

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden: The Boas formula.

**Deputy K.F. Morel:** The Boas formula, yes.

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

A Jersey formula.

**Deputy K.F. Morel:** The Labey/Boas formula.

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, the Boas formula, I think.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

This should be a quick one before we move on, but in the new One Gov reorganisation, which director general's report into you and for what?

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

If any.

Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

If any.

## The Minister for International Development:

Well, I think we sit under the chief executive area but no one reports into me.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

No? Okay.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, that is absolutely fine. This is what we are trying to understand.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

Nobody seems to understand who is, where is what, where, et cetera, so we thought it was time to ask and see if anyone knew.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Exactly.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

So, going back to more general points because it is our first really, what overseas visits have you undertaken since you have been a Minister?

## The Minister for International Development:

In 2017 I went to ...

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Well you were not a Minister then, were you?

## The Minister for International Development:

No, I was not, sorry. Since I have been a Minister?

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

Yes.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Right, okay, since July I have not. I went on our community work project in Lebanon last year because I helped set that one up. We have received World Bank over here. I happened to be on a private visit to New York over New Year and I went to visit the U.N. because we do a lot of work with the U.N. in Syria and places and they had invited us to New York in December and we felt we could not justify the flights. So I was on a private visit and so I saw them.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Okay. The other side of the coin to that: have you received any overseas visitors or they came under the umbrella of a different department if they came?

## The Minister for International Development:

Oh no, we have received World Bank and ...

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Your department has received them, yes?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes. Yes, because ...

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Okay, anyone else?

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I ask what the World Bank visit was for?

## The Minister for International Development:

Specifically, I think ...

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Shall I?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, you go.

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

I have just been corresponding with her this morning. Greta Bull is a Director of the World Bank Group but also Chief Executive of C.G.A.P. (Consultative Group to Assist the Poor) which is a very influential network of governments and donors and banks and the Gates Foundation which focuses on financial inclusion, so bringing financial services to the bottom of the pyramid. As we just said, this is one of the areas where Jersey has a real comparative advantage, so she was able, hosted by the Minister, to meet the Chief Minister and Jersey Finance. Jersey Finance organised a meeting with financial services organisations; we met the J.F.S.C. (Jersey Financial Services Commission). Again, while we try to look for ways to add value and also do things which make sense to people in Jersey as a centre of expertise in financial services, there is a lot of crossover of what we can provide to poor people and poor governments. So, banking supervision or learning how to sandbox different regulations to do with Know Your Customer, for example. These are all really important in the context of Sierra Leone, for example, and they are things that Jersey can add value to at no additional cost but we want to participate in these global discussions.

## The Minister for International Development:

We do receive quite a few N.G.O.s (Non-Government Organisations) over here and Simon and I see them in London. We have got the British Red Cross coming over next week to give a talk because we are launching out ...

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Looking at government, are there any others in the pipeline?

## The Minister for International Development:

Well we have got British Red Cross, we have got one in June, that is Durrell, their conservation. We are going to Lebanon in May because it is the A.G.M. (Annual General Meeting) of C.G.A.P., what Simon was just talking about. We have quarterly meetings with U.N.O.C.H.A. (United Nations Office for the Co-ordination of Humanitarian Affairs), so that is by Skype, and that is fantastic because we tune in and have meetings. We tune in, Jersey tunes in, along with the U.K., Germany, Sweden, others, all around the table and have quarterly meetings with the head of the U.N. in Syria. The meetings are conducted from Damascus, so we can keep ...

Deputy S.M. Wickenden: All on Skype?

**The Minister for International Development:** All on Skype.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:** Much safer, I think.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I just ask, interestingly, in such a meeting, does Jersey sit as part of the U.K. or it sits on its own?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

No.

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, and we are so proud of that. We sit around the table with all these big countries ...

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Well we have conflicting answers, and I do apologise.

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

On its own?

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

On its own.

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Yes, not as part of the U.K.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

We sit as Jersey, not as part of the U.K.?

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Yes.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Oh, not as part of the U.K.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, sorry, I asked if you sat as part of the U.K.

## The Minister for International Development:

Oh no, sorry. Sorry, sorry, I missed that bit. No, we sit on our own. So we are there and Great Britain sits there; we sit here.

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

I often think, I would love to be a fly on the wall as they go around as the head of the U.N. in Damascus and when of course you have dialling in, you have Beirut and Amman in Jordan and they say: "Then over to St. Helier" and I would love to just sort of ... there must be a real feeling of "What?" around the table. But it is great. We are part of this advisory board, so we are really up to date with the allocation of humanitarian funding in Syria. As the Minister says, the publications, Jersey is treated as an equal with other countries.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Just, lastly, I am going to Rwanda in June.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Okay, thank you.

#### Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

Are you planning to make any further changes to the commission's structure while you are now Minister? So now you have taken on this role as the Minister with the commission, are there any changes that you would like to make or intend to make?

#### The Minister for International Development:

We have undergone over the past couple of years a governance review. So we decided because we are an independent arm's-length organisation and there was not another independent ... there are arm's-length organisations but not ... so we were something of an anomaly. So we wanted to sort of, especially with all the changes happening in government and the restructuring, we wanted to secure exactly who we are and what we are and what level Simon is, even though he is not a civil servant. None of the staff in Jersey, as you say, are technically civil servants but obviously we wanted to feed into ... so we have undergone a governance review and we want to go along with all the financial directions, so Simon attends meetings now. Or has not yet.

#### Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

But that is the plan.

#### The Minister for International Development:

He is about to. But, no, that was decided a month ago, so our structure finally is more established now than it has ever been and I think it is a good one. It is one where we can feed into and be accountable to government but still retain a certain amount of independence.

#### Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

That kind of leads on nicely because, as you say, it is an arm's-length body but an independent commission.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

That now has a Minister.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

That now has a Minister which is in government and part of the whole government structure. What have you done to make sure that the independence is sacrosanct in what is going on when you are the Minister that is part of a whole government?

## The Minister for International Development:

Well I see Jersey Overseas Aid as completely bullet-proofed because we have, as I said at the beginning, 3 non-States commissioners and 3 States commissioners. So, once the States has given us the grant, it is up to those 6 people, myself included, to decide how we allocate the funding. So that is in a pocket of its own, it cannot be interfered with.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

That is interesting. So, obviously we are used to the idea that a Minister sets policy but in this case what you are saying is, really, as you said earlier, you are there to represent overseas aid at the top table and there are justifications for that?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

But when it comes to policy setting, it is still the 6 people who set that policy and as Minister you do not have necessarily any greater voice than ... I am saying this rather than asking you but is it correct? Have I said that correctly?

## The Minister for International Development:

That is right. Anything over and above the Jersey Overseas Aid role, like I said, like the Island identity international profile that I can hopefully do at some point which is cutting across various departments, that will be over and above. It is still international development but it is not part of our aid giving.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

So having said all that, presumably when you make your pitch for the budget the commission needs, you will know from within the commission what you would like to have, will you not? So does that influence your ...

## The Minister for International Development:

Well the commission's budget is what it is and we have got a bid in at the moment that goes to government. But whatever keeps me going over and above that, if support or resources are eventually, maybe, allocated to do other international work, that is ...

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

What I am really saying is, when fighting for your budget, presumably in discussion you will be telling the Council of Ministers maybe what your hopes are?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

So, could that be seen to be a non-independent, shall I say?

## The Minister for International Development:

No, I think it enhances Jersey Overseas Aid to have a seat around the table to be able to influence and suggest what Jersey needs to be doing.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

I am not challenging you, just trying to get ... see how independent you were really of Ministers. Yes, okay.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Which leads to the next bit. I saw on the Jersey Overseas Aid website an advertisement for policy officer which I believe is overdue and should be taken down because it says: "Apply by December 2018." Yes, so again it is this idea of, as Minister, we think of you setting policy but you are advertising for a policy officer within Overseas Aid so, yes, it is kind of trying to understand what the role of that policy officer will be in relation to your role as Minister. How do you see them working?

#### The Minister for International Development:

Well the policy officer will work for Jersey Overseas Aid. She is going to be ...

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Is this the person joining in May, out of interest?

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

#### Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

I will manage her. We are 3, as the Minister said, becoming 4 so although we try and have clearly delineated roles, we all do a bit of it as well. The goal of bringing on another international aid and development professional will primarily strengthen our ability to be strategic, also in particular to work with the finance sector. One of the big parts of her role will be developing our co-ordination with finance and philanthropy on the Island, and that is her background as well, but equally supporting the Minister and me on trips, on speeches, on public interventions, that kind of thing.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

From a policy perspective, would this be an appropriate ... is this the way it is going to work: along with you, she comes up with policy, puts that to the 6 people on the commission and they ratify, they challenge, they scrutinise, they then decide whether to adopt those policies or not?

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

I think there are 2 things to be saying about aid: what is aid policy? So there are 2 things: in one sense Jersey's aid policy is what it spends on different projects. The other is: what do we want to achieve and where are we going?

[11:45]

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

So she is just the aid policy side then?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Rather than the strategic: where is overseas aid going?

#### Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Well she will help us deliver parts of that policy which commissioners have set, so in a sense working out what countries we are going to work in is policy and that is something that has been decided by commissioners. Jersey Overseas Aid will produce its first ever strategic plan which we are finalising now.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes, and which will go to the States.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

When do you expect that to happen?

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

In summer.

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, probably later on in the summer.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

I have one about the difference between what work were you responsible for other than the commission. You have already answered that, so can I bound on to - it is difficult to say in this day and age of natural disasters - but what proportion of your work is involved in planned work and how much reactive?

## The Minister for International Development:

So the beginning of the year we set a budget for emergencies. Last year it was £2.8 million and as we go through the year we then revisit our budget, probably in October. We might have some monies left on grant aid or in one of the other pockets that we have allocated and nothing in emergencies, so we might move some over to emergencies because the aim at the end of the year is to get to zero.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

I am sure it is, yes. You will have no problem with getting to zero.

#### The Minister for International Development:

No problem.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

So it is about between a quarter and a third?

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Exactly. It is between 20 and 30 per cent. Because, as the Minister said, we are increasingly doing multi-year projects for the ...

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, I knew you were going to complicate it like ...

#### Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Because increasingly, when we get to the beginning of a year, our budget, much of it is already committed, so we have moved away from one-year projects which have a very limited effectiveness and even more limited sustainability, to 3, 4 and, in the case of Durrell, 5-year projects. That means when you get to the beginning of the year, maybe 60 per cent of our budget is already committed. So, as the Minister said, the commissioners will then allocate nominally an envelope for emergency funding, almost all of which is not committed at the beginning because it, by definition, needs to be responsive and that is usually 20 to 30 per cent, so £2 to 3 million. Within that, some of the money is kept for responses, for example, Cyclone Idai now. We are looking hard, we are in contact with 7 or 8 aid agencies that we know well in the countries which have been worst affected; we are working out what Jersey's response should be. But we also try and fund humanitarian and emergency things in a more strategic manner. So the Syrian Humanitarian Fund, which the Minister was talking about which we sit on the advisory board, is an example of that where we try and fund pooled funds in places that we know are going to need humanitarian funding.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes, like Yemen, we will focus on this year.

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Exactly. Central African Republic, Syria. In doing so it means that Jersey funds can be where they are needed immediately. Within 72 hours, Jersey funds can be accessed by N.G.O.s, U.N. agencies, the Red Cross movement and local organisations. I mean, people, professionals on the ground are able to do the due diligence that we are not able to do: the risk management, the oversight and making sure that the funds are spent properly. It contributes to the co-ordination of the humanitarian system. One of the big problems is fragmentation of lots and lots of agencies trying to ... you have probably read about after the tsunami, hundreds of agencies all with little projects, whereas if you are contributing to pooled funds, you are also contributing to the co-ordination of the humanitarian response. This is the sort of thing, as the Minister said, which is also getting Jersey noticed because we are doing this alongside other bigger, much bigger, governmental donors. So we contribute to things called these Country-based Pooled Funds which are run by the U.N. and I think with the Start Network or the Start Fund, which is a network of 42 N.G.O.s which themselves then decide who is best placed to respond most quickly and most effectively in an emergency.

#### Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

I was going to ask, the chairman and myself were in Westminster on Wednesday when Theresa May declared in question time that there was £6 million from the U.K. being put towards the Cyclone

Idai disaster. So is this how you, with those different agencies, know that your money is going into a specific area when we are going to be giving a lot less money than the £6 million, which is over half of what our budget currently is?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, that is why the pooled funds are sometimes far more effective for smaller donors like in Syria, for example, and the money is there. It is up to them to deploy the money in the ways that they feel best and choose the best-placed agencies to deliver.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Yes, I understand all that and obviously it is a good scheme. What I am really getting at though is, I mean, say, these natural disasters are coming thick and fast these days, you mentioned Idai, you could justify then blowing the lot on it ... you are not blowing the lot on it, I know, but then there will be times surely when you want to give them that, do you always keep some back for the next one or is the expectation you are going to have to go back to government for more?

## The Minister for International Development:

Well we do not; this is our budget. I mean, we would like more. We could spend our budget 10 times over but, as I say, we normally get to October time and if we see we have got nothing in emergencies, we might switch. But if a disaster happens and we have got no funding, we cannot support it.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Okay.

#### Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

We try and keep back some money, exactly. If we remember that the tsunami was on Boxing Day and things happen in Q4 as well so, exactly, we do try and keep some money back for the end of the year from the disaster pot but if we have not got the money, then we have not got the money.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I ask quickly: how do you decide which disasters to contribute to?

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Do you want to?

#### The Minister for International Development:

No, you can do that.

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Okay, so let us use Idai as an example. I mean, as in fact you have all rightly said at different points, the needs are so great and that there are disasters thick and fast, many of which just do not make the news but are just as worthy of support. In fact, sometimes almost the under-reported ones are more important to contribute to. We have 8 or 9 recognised large humanitarian partners, so we do not accept proposals from just any agency, we only work with ones that we know well and that we have already done the due diligence on and that we know are good. We have an ongoing conversation with them, we obviously monitor what is going on in the world as well very closely, and they will contact us and suggest: "Well, look, there are needs here, how about this?" We, as the sort of executive part of the office, will have an initial analysis sift of that. If we think that there is an advantage for Jersey to respond either because it is extremely unreported and there is a huge need ... one example of that has been, most people, I suggest, do not know that the world's second largest Ebola outbreak has been underway in the Democratic Republic of Congo. Commissioners decided this was a good thing to support earlier on this year, even though that was not front page of the J.E.P. (Jersey Evening Post). If we believe that the disaster is sufficiently serious, that the response needs money and that it is going to be well co-ordinated and well delivered, we will then ask which agencies ... in the case of Idai, we will be talking to 7 or 8 agencies; sometimes it is 2 or 3. We will get in short proposals, very much unlike the development side which now, if organisations want our money, they need 50 or 60-page documents of outcomes and how they will measure them and risk plans and things like that. For humanitarian things we intentionally keep it short. I, or J.O.A. (Jersey Overseas Aid) will then write an analysis of where we think the money is best placed based on what they are going to achieve and how well co-ordinated it is, largely, and make a recommendation to commissioners who will have the final say of how much should be allocated and according to which agencies. We can do that pretty quickly, as the Minister said.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Brilliant, thank you.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Yes, sorry, can I just quickly ask? A topical point, child refugees; it is topical. I have a presentation outside, as you know, I have to go to and I know you have got an appointment later. What is the role of you as the Minister for International Development, if any, or is it a primary domestic matter?

#### The Minister for International Development:

If we are to bring child refugees into Jersey, I think primarily it is a Home Office-type issue. I think that the first issue is child welfare here, host families, so it is a domestic issue here if they are on-

Island. While we have huge amounts of sympathy for those children, and we have seen many of them in the refugee camps both in Jordan and Lebanon, but it is far more complex than just taking a child in and giving it a home. So, having said that, we are hugely sympathetic and I always like to remind people that Jersey received humanitarian aid during the last world war. There are some people who tend ...

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

So if I can just interject because I think it is an important point, I have family members who were refugees in the Second World War from Jersey. I think many families over here did have ...

## The Minister for International Development:

So, I think it is an issue that Jersey has to consider. However, I think as far as Jersey Overseas Aid goes, we have given monies. We prefer to give monies upstream, if you like. I mean, there are different issues, for example, if we are hosting or giving children homes here, are we enticing them to make the trip across the Mediterranean or are we better off educating them in the camps and what have you? Because certainly in the camps, every person I spoke to, they do not want to come here, they want to go back to Syria. But it is far more complex because, do we just accept Syrian refugees or do we go into Afghanistan, Yemen, Burma?

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Sorry, I was not asking you to justify that, I just wanted to know what your role was; you cleared that. It is perhaps worth making the point that ... were you at the presentation last night at all?

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

I could not make it.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

No? You are absolutely right, I am not sure the complexities to which you have rightly referred have been fully understood by the audience and that they will come out, I am sure.

#### The Minister for International Development:

So as far as Jersey Overseas Aid goes, our remit is to help them upstream and that is what ... I mean, we would obviously like to do a lot more for them in the camps.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Could I just ask: if Jersey made the decision to accept some refugees with their children or not, could you imagine there being a role for the department, for Jersey Overseas Aid Commission, in liaising with external organisations who might help us select appropriate recipients, that sort of thing? Do

you think there could be a role, while I accept that you are not involved in the decision-making as to whether we take refugees or not?

## The Minister for International Development:

If I could just say, we would always be prepared to help if we can with our connections with our aid agencies if they were indeed the body to help, but I would have thought there must be routes where - well I would hope - if children are being brought to the U.K. or found ...

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

There is a process already in place that sets out the right level.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

That is fair enough.

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, I would certainly hope so.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Yes, it is a complex thing. Now moving on to a more general matter, the interaction, if any, with the Minister for External Relations and department, you used the expression, what was it?

## The Minister for International Development:

Aid and trade.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Aid and trade. Now assuming the point is that your responsibility is promoting economic and social development in developing countries, so in a way that could touch on the economic side as well, so what is the interaction?

## The Minister for International Development:

Well, we obviously get on very well with External Relations and our whole international profile Island identity, the identity and international profile that they go and deliver to various places around the world, is it should be ... this is my international development bit, not Jersey Overseas Aid bit. So, there is a job of work to be done, they are to work more closely together but we are certainly very willing.

[12:00]

With Jersey Overseas Aid, obviously we have our 7 countries and if, for example, External Relations are wanting to develop financial or their global markets in Rwanda and Malawi, for example, I will just say - no, I do not think Malawi is on the list - let us say Ghana, so those 2 countries. They are our countries, so we can provide External Relations with all the work that we have done in those countries. It can work that way around; it cannot work the other way around where they say: "We would like to develop global markets there, so would you mind going to give them aid?" So that is the way it has got to work.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Just a follow up, so basically if the Minister for External Relations had plans to go to one of your 7 countries, you will perhaps try and hitch a lift, as it were?

#### The Minister for International Development:

Well we would certainly give ...

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

But you would not go necessarily on that?

#### The Minister for International Development:

Well not necessarily but we would certainly give him all the information of what Jersey has been doing down there because that is a co-ordinated government and sort of ...

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Just quickly, some concrete examples: the memorandum of understanding with Rwanda is something that we contributed to. We attend the global markets meetings, we are working with External Relations and the A.G. (Attorney General) on the return of confiscated assets which in some cases are to developing countries, and we have frequent meetings with External Relations about all of those. But the point is that, almost by definition, we are focusing more on countries that are less interesting to Jersey from the point of view of trade.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

By definition, yes.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I just? Recently, the Minister for External Relations travelled to the U.A.E. (United Arab Emirates) and it was notable on his agenda he met people who I would have thought would have been of interest to Jersey Overseas Aid, one that I believe they were talking about was financial inclusions, and that is one of your themes. So, yes, you were not on that trip but would the Minister for External Relations brief you on a meeting like that, if you know what I mean, where ...

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

The other way around, we briefed him.

**Deputy K.F. Morel:** You briefed him in advance of that trip?

**Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:** Yes.

**The Minister for International Development:** Yes.

**Deputy K.F. Morel:** Thanks, it is good to know.

The Minister for International Development:

Yes, because of the people he was meeting.

#### Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, but then would he tell you what he had said? What had been said at that meeting afterwards?

#### Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Yes, at official's level, anyway, and I am sure it is the same at ministerial level, in an open and frequent conversation about these things.

#### Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

So do you have forward sight of the Minister for External Relation's calendar for planned visits? So do you know what is going on in the future with the plans of External Relations? Are you involved at early stages before they get to the point of setting something up?

#### The Minister for International Development:

No, I would think it is fair to say that we do not get involved beforehand. If they are going to certainly one of our countries or they are meeting people that they feel we have the expertise, knowledge or contacts, then they will let us know. But I think when we finalise our strategic plan which, as I said, should be in the summer some time, that is when we are going to formalise a little more our relationship with External Relations and have an M.O.U. (Memorandum of Understanding) with them but just what you said is something that I would envisage us doing in the future.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

Start the building.

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Yes.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

You include them in your forward plan? Certainly the strategic plan would set that out but, yes.

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, and certainly they know the countries that we are in. So if Ian Gorst was going to Nepal, for instance, then we could give him ...

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Do you envisage future trips where you might travel together, picking up ... the Minister for External Relations perhaps talking about finance and the trade aspect and you holding a separate agenda but focused on ... if he want to Nepal or something?

## The Minister for International Development:

Within reason. Within reason. I am not entirely sure I would be completely comfortable going to somewhere like U.A.E. in charge of overseas aid.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes. But if he was to travel to Malawi?

## The Minister for International Development:

Yes, absolutely. Absolutely.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

That is fine.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

We are finishing up, so is there anything else that you would like to add, particularly you would like the public to hear or to know?

## The Minister for International Development:

We are launching our Jersey International Development network forum on Tuesday evening at 6.00 p.m. straight after the States, so there is no excuse. You can all walk down to the Pomme d'Or where we have got the British Red Cross coming over to give a talk and we are going to be doing them quarterly based on our themes and more, I think. I do not know, do you have anything?

#### **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Yes, we are really trying to up our outreach to people in Jersey who so want to get involved and so often do. So we are launching this network where we will have talks and debates and presentations about things of interest.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

So it is very much a public event?

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

Very much.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Trying to pull the strands together, all the charities. As Simon said, people are wanting to work together but there is no sort of body central where they can share ideas, so that is what we are trying to do, some initiative events.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Can I have a supplementary, if I may?

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, go for it. Absolutely.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Sorry. You mentioned the charities, and without naming names, there are those who have criticised Jersey as a tax haven or whatever you will and obviously have a political element to it. I am assuming you are ...

#### The Minister for International Development:

Do you mean the N.G.O.s? Oxfam?

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Yes. Well not necessarily that one but others, yes.

#### The Minister for International Development:

Yes.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

You take note of that in the context with whom you work, I take it?

#### The Minister for International Development:

We have absolutely taken note of that, yes.

#### The Deputy of St. Mary:

Thank you.

#### Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

I was just going to ask, when doing these events, are you planning on doing one of the diaspora events in London maybe to talk to some of the Jersey residents that are spread around to let them know what is going on?

## The Minister for International Development:

Would that not be great? Yes.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

External Relations organises them so ...

## The Minister for International Development:

Well, yes, exactly.

## Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

I gave a speech 2 weeks ago to the Jersey Society in London who were very interested ...

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

I only discovered they existed about 3 days ago.

## **Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:**

But, no, it is good.

## The Minister for International Development:

But, yes, our outreach work, we are doing various bits with Trackers and going into schools now, so we are doing more. We have offered an internship to an Islander and our first intern went off to Nepal for 6 months, 5 months? Oh, Burma. Burma. The current one is in Nepal.

## The Deputy of St. Mary:

Do you know what it is called now?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Myanmar.

#### The Minister for International Development:

She has now come back and they have offered her a job, HelpAge, so that is fantastic. We are going to keep those going, so one a year. Yes, so our outreach is something and maybe ...

#### Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

We have reached I think 17 schools last year with workshops about water in development. We are seeing if we can also get something on the S.T.E.M. (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics) curriculum where we can teach children science and engineering aspects of development which are often some of the things that we support as well.

Deputy K.F. Morel: Absolutely.

**Deputy S.M. Wickenden:** Wonderful.

Deputy K.F. Morel: Thank you very much indeed.

**The Minister for International Development:** Okay.

The Deputy of St. Mary: We could have the next half hour for our ...

**Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:** 

We could, yes.

**Deputy K.F. Morel:** We crossed a load off, by the way.

The Minister for International Development:

We have probably got the time, if you wanted to.

#### Executive Director, Jersey Overseas Aid Commission:

Yes, I think we can both talk the hind legs off the ...

## The Minister for International Development:

Well you can. You can.

## Deputy S.M. Wickenden:

You are always so quiet, Carolyn.

## Deputy K.F. Morel:

Thank you so much.

[12:07]